

## Historical re-enactments in tourist practices and politics of memory

I. S. Posokhov

V.N. Karazin Kharkiv National University; Kharkiv; Ukraine  
Corresponding author. E-mail: posokhis@gmail.com

Paper received 24.05.18; Accepted for publication 31.05.18.

<https://doi.org/10.31174/SEND-HS2018-168VI27-08>

**Abstract.** The author studies the theoretical aspects of historical re-enactments. In particular, the analysis of the use of "re-enactment", "show", "festival", "living history" concepts are made, in the context of international experience. Some of the trends and prospects of rehabilitation of the festival re-enactments in the world are determined. Attention is drawn to the fact that historical re-enactment is not only a tool for tourism and a form of recreation, but also the way to construction or even manipulation of memory. Accordingly, the author concludes that the implementation of historical re-enactments requires the introduction of a kind of ethics code to guide the organizers of such events. Tendencies and prospects of historical re-enactments development in Ukraine and the world in the context of memory policy are shown.

**Keywords:** *historical re-enactment, tourism industry, tourism policy, politics of memory.*

Various cultural activities in the recent years have played a significant role in the activities of individual tourist attractions, regions or even countries. They are actively used to draw the attention of the media, attracting the local population to various forms of leisure. Many countries spend enormous money on organizing festivals, which sometimes attract hundreds of thousands of tourists. Such measures require the creation of a powerful infrastructure that must withstand the true "invasion" of the participants, which often form large-scale settlements. Indeed, the actualization in this form of historical and cultural heritage seems to open up great prospects for educational work. On the other hand, such festivals and similar events are often conceived as following the demands of post-culture (with its "game in reality"). In part, they represent a simple copying of somewhere official officials from culture. Recently, more and more these measures are subject to commercial goals, and unfortunately, people are not organized enough for this purpose, with emphasis on primitive effects. Often in Ukraine, such festivals (for example, ethnic festivals) are called "historical re-enactment". But is it really possible to say so? To what extent do we use world experience in this case?

The purpose of the study is to analyze the theoretical aspects of an issue of historical re-enactment, as well as to identify the trends and prospects for the development of historical re-enactment in Ukraine and in the world in the context of the memory policy.

In Ukraine the studies of the tourism industry as a complex economic-social and cultural phenomenon are dealt with by O. Lyubitseva, A. Parfynenko, and others. Foreign researchers D. Baldwin, E. Bruner and others [3; 4; 6] made significant contribution into the development of organization problems and to the assess the effectiveness of festivals and historical re-enactments in tourism. The study of the peculiarities of the organization and carrying out of historical re-enactments is also dealt with by Russian scientists A. Nikolsky, V. Khabarov [1; 2]. In our opinion, it's time for Ukrainian scientists to pay attention to this kind of an issue.

In historical re-enactment we understand first of all the restoration of the appearance and design of an object or phenomenon, based on its surviving fragments, remnants and historical information available about it, using modern methods of historical science. Similarly, historical re-enactment of processes, events, technologies and rituals is determined. The term "historical reconstruction" is often identified in the post-Soviet space with the term "historical research". The term "re-enactment" can be defined as reproduction of material and spiritual culture of a particular historical period or region

using archaeological, visual and written sources.

In the former Soviet Union, historical re-enactments have been developing rapidly since the 1990s. A classic example is the re-enactment of the Battle of Borodino, which traditionally takes place in the first week of September on the historic field west of Moscow. It is large-scale sight, which involves thousands of properly equipped and trained people (hundreds of cavalrymen, about a thousand infantrymen, using dozens of guns). The action is seen by thousands of tourists, and is widely covered in the media. Such events become a significant factor in the formation of historical representations. But if the re-enactment of Borodino's battle takes place in strict accordance with the available historical data, then many other "re-enactments" are the result of the creative imagination of the organizers and participants and look like a show. Accordingly, it should be recognized that the earlier historical imagination of an ordinary person formed images based on essentially canonical texts (text-books on history, the most famous works of art and films), and now it is essentially influenced by improvisation on the fields of "historical re-enactments". Unfortunately, this situation remains not investigated in Ukraine. So far, only the organizers of the tourism business are engaged in "re-enactments". But, obviously, such measures may inevitably become a form of implementation of a certain policy of memory. So their analysis should be carried out by scientists. It is more interesting to draw attention to the European and world experience in organizing historical re-enactments and approaches to understanding of this phenomenon. Moreover, the number of such "historical re-enactments" is growing at a very fast pace around the world - in the world there are thousands of them [10, p. 14].

In the foreign literature, for the purpose of designating such measures, somewhat different in terms of content are used, and, accordingly, the events themselves are perceived differently. In particular, Western literature often uses the term "re-enactment event" (literally, the event scenario, a circumstance), which is understood as an "event of cultural heritage," since the main goal is to represent the (local) past (cultural) aspect of a cultural life for a wide audience [8, p. 22]. The essence of this direction, for example, can be the study and application in practice of military art of a certain age. Much of the necessary information is taken from the sources that have been preserved, some (clothing items) are being refined by humans, based on common sense. As a result, there is a spectacular action that attracts tourists. Such battle scenes can be divided into productions (for spectators, films, scientific experiments, etc.) and sports, where people

can appreciate their strengths and abilities. That is why, as a complement to the concept of "re-enactment event" often use the word "tournament" (which clearly focuses on the orientation of the event).

Western researchers also distinguish the so-called "living history" [7, p. 388], "the exhibits of which are often located in the museum context and fall into the annual or timed celebration (cultural heritage) in a particular place" [8, p. 53]. "Living history" combines the material things, activities, symbols into one interactive presentation, which aims to give observers and event participants the feeling that they took a step back in time. Living history does not necessarily set the goal of reproducing a particular event in history - the reproduction of the history of culture is more important. According to the scientists, "living history" is at the intersection of such disciplines as "experimental archeology" and "museum pedagogy." It represents the reproduction of everyday life of inhabitants of a certain area in a certain historical period, usually in the form of organizing a "museum of living history" or conducting a "festival of living history", as well as lessons of "living history" in schools. Everything is important here, from the cut and look of the clothes to the authentic recipes of the kitchen, behavior and language. Thus, the term "living history" has rather wide limits and may include what we mean by the term "historical re-enactment" (when measures are built on scenarios of an entertaining nature, but the requirements for such scenarios are still tighter). Such events are interesting not only for the participants themselves but also for viewers who can not only look at their country's unusual history but also join it.

"Historical reconstructions" can be divided into several categories and according to other criteria. Yes, it is possible to distinguish reconstruction of events (Bristol Renaissance Fair, Whitehall Parade (London)) reconstruction of objects (Zaporizhzhya Sich), reconstruction of symbolic actions and rituals (meeting of the Maltese Order in the museum complex in Gatchina). However, obviously, even a few individual terms existing in English, are not enough to refer to all species diversity. "Historical reconstructions" can be very different among themselves both in the purpose of laying the target and the nature of the material to be restored, since it is possible to further distinguish ideological, behavioral, technical, material reconstruction, etc.

The implementation of "historical re-enactments" around the world is associated with the interaction of different interests. Actually, in this you can see an issue. In particular, this is manifested in the practical organization of "historical re-enactments". So, the "living history" format is often stated in the regulations for conducting festivals of historical re-enactment, but it is often an advertising exaggeration. Festivals of historical re-enactment, as a rule, are spent on funds allocated from the budget of administrations of cities, regions, as well as at the expense of sponsors. The customers of the events, accordingly, have their own requirements - for them, the entertainment, tourism development, attracting of the maximum number of tourists, reducing costs due to the self-sufficiency of the event are important, and the "authenticity" is not the main goal. According to the researchers, this already contributes to the fact that at the level of economic approach to the organization of the festival there is a substitution of the concepts of "living history" and "show" [8, p. 40]. The customers and sponsors of the festival are not ready to pay the costs of preparing the experiment, they are not very concerned about the correspondence of the result of the

past reality. Any show is made for viewers - most of them also do not need science data and high authenticity, because the tourists came to relax and enjoy the event. That is why the "show" format festivals require crafts, which, firstly, are understood by tourists, and secondly, they are distinguished by the spectacular process and the reach of the result. But even if there are two approaches to historical re-enactment - actually a scientific reconstruction (experiment) and reconstruction as a type of leisure, differing in their purpose and, accordingly, in the methods of implementation, then it becomes obvious - in real life, the demarcation line between them is sometimes very difficult to make. It is not so easy to achieve authenticity; rather, we have stylization for reconstruction. Naturally, the further the epoch is, the less information we have, it is necessary to constantly make assumptions on the basis of available scanty data about what was not, but it could be. Reconstruction often reduces to the reproduction of material things (weapons, money, jewelry, clothes, windows in houses, etc.), however, there is also another its component - the possession of these things (the ability to wear things, fencing, dancing, etc.). Some researchers point out another component - a broad and deep immersion in the outlook of people of the "era and region" [5, p. 23].

In this regard, the difficult question arises: how to make the participants involved in the action meet these high requirements? Thus, often we are dealing with reproduction (modeling), which reduces to external copying of individual elements, mainly material culture, often with the use of modern materials and technologies. In this case, the share of authentic technologies and materials is insignificant. As for spiritual culture and social sphere, the attempts of reconstruction in this sphere are very complex and controversial, therefore they are often of a gaming nature. In this context, the notion of "level of reliability" should also be mentioned - a set of criteria of validity, which determines the reliability of the reconstruction of a material object or process at the level of sources, materials and technologies. Indeed, there is an issue of interpretation, an understanding of the source. Any reconstruction, created on the basis of interpretations of facts, cannot be a "true reconstruction" in principle. Therefore, any statement about "complete reconstruction" of a particular object, event or ritual is nothing more than an advertisement.

The level of authenticity of material objects is determined by various assessment criteria [2, p. 13]. So, the "copy" is an object made in the same sizes and using the same technology, from the same materials, as in the time of existence of things. "Replica" - an object made, as well as a copy, but taking into account the size of the modern owner (for example, knightly paints). "Stylization" - an object that coincides with contours with existing typologies, from historically valid materials, with the use of modern technologies. "Properties" - an object made or not of historically correct materials, but corresponds to existing typologies, or, conversely, is made of historically correct materials, but not true by typologies (manufacturing technology is not important in this case) [2, p. 14]. Thus, for example, the use of modern technology in historically correct materials transforms the historical reconstruction of the material object into a historical stylization. The use of modern materials in the use of non-authentic technologies makes the reconstruction of the object in general for the fortune-teller, that is, the creation of a substantially tangible atmosphere by simulating real objects. In this regard, it should be recognized that instead of historical

reconstruction, tourists are more likely to see historic styling or even props. And such measures would be more appropriately called not "historical reconstruction", but "historic stylization". But the organizers will never agree with this, the substitution of concepts became the ideological basis of the events themselves. In the opinion of many scholars and museum workers, the massive use of copies and stylization has a dangerous tendency - in the consciousness of society the line between the concepts of "original" and "copy" disappears, the equivalent of presentation of the copy and the original becomes. There is a devaluation and discrediting of real things.

However, one should agree with statements about the importance of holding such events for the local population and local culture. Historically, the festival is a time of celebration, relaxation and renewal of forces after a period of hard work. An essential function of such activities is the consolidation of the local community, the cultivation of positive heroes and the continuation of traditions. Obviously, historical reconstruction of events does fulfill some of these functions. The researchers D. Picard and M. Robinson also believe that historical re-enactments, as well as their prototypes in the past, "are complex layers of social reality", which not only mark the unity of people, but also give the possibility to "escape from the present" through theatrical action (which is possible only when it involves a lot of people) [9, p. 70]. So, E. Bruner believes that "living history" can be a good way to learn about the past [4, p. 406]. This opinion is shared by other researchers who argue that authenticity should not be a

barrier to understanding the "main truth" of the past [6, p. 73]. Indeed, many people want to get involved in history precisely in order to understand the foundations of the past and build on this basis the vectors of their future.

So, the latest political and psychological technologies allow to shape public opinion purposefully, manipulating with social consciousness with the help of historical knowledge and historical memory, which in this case are designed with a predetermined purpose, with the help of specially selected information, to influence emotions, motives, thinking and behavior of people. Historical memory can be used to maintain stability in society or, conversely, it can provoke conflicts. Historical re-enactment is not only a means of tourism development and one of the forms of organization of leisure, but also a way to construct or even manipulate a memory. On the one hand, the question arises of who carries out or should (and in general, if any) have control over them, otherwise, in other cases, such festivals and shows with elements of history will develop spontaneously, and the effect that they may give will be unpredictable. On the other hand, there is a question of professional, ethical, etc. responsibility for the implementation of a certain policy in the field of historical re-enactments, since history is a common human heritage. That is why, in our opinion, a wide range of specialists from different fields of science should be involved in the issue of "historical re-enactments", and the implementation of such a policy should be controlled by various civil society structures.

#### ЛИТЕРАТУРА

1. Никольский А. Б. Методологические проблемы исторической реконструкции. – Режим доступа: <http://www.newchrono.ru/prcv/doklad/methodology.htm>
2. Хабаров В. В. Реконструкторам о реконструкции // Реконструкция исторического костюма: Сб. м-лов Fashion-блока XV Международного фестиваля "Зиланткон". – Казань, 2006. – С. 8–16.
3. Bowdin G. Events Management / Edited by: Bowdin, G., McDonnell, I., Allen, J. O'Toole, W. – Oxford, 2001: Butterworth-Heinemann. – 536 p.
4. Bruner E. M. Abraham Lincoln as authentic reproduction: A critique of postmodernism. – American Anthropologist, 1994. – № 96. – P. 397–415.
5. Caillois R. The sacred as transgression: Theory of the festival. – Chicago, 2001: University of Illinois Press. – 140 p.
6. Goodacre B., Baldwin G. Living the Past: Reconstruction, Recreation, Re-enactment and Education at Museums and Historical Sites. – London: Middlesex University Press, 2002. – 224 p.
7. Hunt S. Acting the part: 'Living history' as a serious leisure pursuit. – Leisure Studies, 2004. – №23. – P. 387–403.
8. Long P., Robinson M. Tourism and Cultural Festivals and Events: Marketing, Management and Evaluation. – Sunderland: Business Education Publishers, 2004. – 233 p.
9. Picard D., Robinson M. Festivals, Tourism and Social Change. – Clevedon: Channel View Publications, 2006. – 296 p.
10. Smith M. K. Issues in Cultural Tourism Studies. – London: Routledge, 2003. – 195 p.

#### REFERENCES

1. Nikolskiy A. B. Methodological problems of historical reconstruction // <http://www.newchrono.ru/prcv/doklad/methodology.htm>
2. Khabarov V. B. For reconstructors about the reconstruction // Reconstruction of the historical costume: Kazan, 2006. – P. 8–16.
3. Bowdin G. Events Management / Edited by: Bowdin, G., McDonnell, I., Allen, J. O'Toole, W. – Oxford, 2001: Butterworth-Heinemann. – 536 p.
4. Bruner E. M. Abraham Lincoln as authentic reproduction: A critique of postmodernism. – American Anthropologist, 1994. – № 96. – P. 397–415.
5. Caillois R. The sacred as transgression: Theory of the festival. – Chicago, 2001: University of Illinois Press. – 140 p.
6. Goodacre B., Baldwin G. Living the Past: Reconstruction, Recreation, Re-enactment and Education at Museums and Historical Sites. – London: Middlesex University Press, 2002. – 224 p.
7. Hunt S. Acting the part: 'Living history' as a serious leisure pursuit. – Leisure Studies, 2004. – №23. – P. 387–403.
8. Long P., Robinson M. Tourism and Cultural Festivals and Events: Marketing, Management and Evaluation. – Sunderland: Business Education Publishers, 2004. – 233 p.
9. Picard D., Robinson M. Festivals, Tourism and Social Change. – Clevedon: Channel View Publications, 2006. – 296 p.
10. Smith M. K. Issues in Cultural Tourism Studies. – London: Routledge, 2003. – 195 p.

#### Исторические реконструкции в туристической практике и в политике памяти

И. С. Посохов

**Аннотация.** Целью данного исследования является анализ теоретических аспектов проблемы исторических реконструкций в контексте мирового опыта. Обращается внимание на то, что исторические реконструкции – это не только средство развития туризма и одна из форм организации досуга, но и путь к конструированию или даже манипулированию памятью. Соответственно, делается вывод о том, что осуществление исторических реконструкций требует внедрения своего рода этического кодекса, которым должны руководствоваться организаторы таких мероприятий. Определены тенденции и перспективы развития исторических реконструкций в Украине и мире в контексте политики памяти.

**Ключевые слова:** исторические реконструкции, индустрия туризма, туристическая политика, политика памяти.